
MEETING	EAST AREA PLANNING SUB-COMMITTEE
DATE	25 OCTOBER 2007
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS MOORE (CHAIR), CREGAN, FIRTH, FUNNELL, KING, TAYLOR, WISEMAN, MORLEY (SUBSTITUTE) AND POTTER (SUBSTITUTE)
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLORS DOUGLAS, HYMAN AND VASSIE

50. INSPECTION OF SITES

The following sites were inspected before the meeting:

Site	Attended by	Reason for Visit
4 Pasture Farm Close, Fulford	Councillors Moore and Wiseman	Because objections have been received and the application is recommended for approval.
Derwent County Junior School	Councillors Moore and Wiseman	Because objections have been received and the application is recommended for approval.
14 Dodsworth Avenue	Councillors Moore and Wiseman	At the request of Councillor Potter.

51. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members were invited to declare, at this point in the meeting, any personal or prejudicial interests they might have in the business on the agenda.

Councillor Wiseman declared a personal non-prejudicial interest in Plans Item 4c (Greystones Farm, Towthorpe) as she was a Parish Councillor for Earswick.

52. MINUTES

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the Sub-Committee held on 13 September 2007 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

53. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

54. PLANS LIST

Members considered a schedule of reports of the Assistant Director (Planning and Sustainable Development), relating to the following planning applications, outlining the proposals and relevant policy considerations and setting out the views and advice of consultees and officers.

54a. 14 Dodsworth Avenue York YO31 8TY (07/01342/FUL)

Members considered a full application submitted by Toad Hall Developments for the erection of a bungalow with room in the roof on land adjacent to 1 Irwin Avenue and 14 Dodsworth Avenue.

Representations, in objection, were received from a local resident who was representing objectors on Irwin Avenue. He said that there were no single storey residential dwellings in the area. Residents felt that the site was suitable for a new building but felt that this should be a two-storey house to keep in character with other buildings in the area. He also felt that good design should be a priority.

Representations were received from the Applicant's agent who said that most buildings in the area were two-storey. There was a single storey sub-station on the opposite corner to the proposed development and the scale of the proposed development was mirroring this.

Some Members were concerned with the comparison to the sub-station, which was obscured by trees. They felt that any new development should be in keeping with the housing already in the vicinity. Discussions were had regarding access to the property and the loss of garden land. Other Members suggested that the addition of a dormer window might help, as it would give the appearance of a two-storey building.

Members felt that the roof design needed to be altered.

RESOLVED: That the application be deferred.

REASON: To address concerns regarding the pitch of the roof and the possibility of the inclusion of a dormer window.

54b. Rose Cottage Sutton Road Wigginton York YO32 2RB (07/01224/FUL)

This item was deferred to the next meeting to enable the Applicant to speak.

54c. Greystones Farm Towthorpe Moor Lane Strensall York YO32 9ST (07/00618/FUL)

Members considered a full application submitted by Mr G Chapman for the installation of ground based lighting to serve the golf driving range.

Representations were received from the Applicant who said that ground based lighting was recognised as the best option for driving ranges that

were in sensitive areas. The lights were on until 20.30 and, normally, only during the winter months. He stated that it was imperative to have lighting to enable the business to succeed and survive.

Members discussed the opening hours of the golf driving range.

RESOLVED: That the application be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and the following amended conditions:

Amended Condition 3

The driving range lighting hereby permitted shall not operate between 2030 hours and 0800 hours Monday to Friday and 1900 hours to 0800 hours on Saturdays and Sundays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of local residents and to ensure that wildlife activity is not significantly disturbed within the adjacent woodland.

REASON: That the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the impact on the Green Belt and the amenities of local residential properties. As such the proposal complies with Policies GP1, GB1, GB13 and L3 of the City of York Draft Local Plan.

54d. 4 Pasture Farm Close York YO10 4PZ (06/02767/FUL)

Members considered a full application submitted by Eden Vale Homes for the erection of one new dwelling after the demolition of existing bungalow (resubmission).

An additional representation, in objection, had been received from Fulford Parish Council, this was circulated at the meeting. The points raised were as follows:

- There would be negative effect on the public footpath that forms an important part of the character of the Conservation Area contrary to PPG15 para 4.9 and Draft Local Plan NE1 and HE11
- The gap in the built up area currently allowing views from Main Street through Halfpenny Row through to the Ings will disappear if the proposed development is allowed. This view corridor from Main Street to the Ings will be blocked thus harming the streetscape of Main Street, an important part of the character of Fulford Village Conservation Area contrary to guidance in PPG15 para 4.2 and 4.14 and Draft Local Plan HE2, GP1c.

- There would be a negative effect on views from the Fulford Ings into the Conservation area contrary to PPG15 para 4.14 and Draft Local Plan SP3, GP1e, NE2.

Representations, in objection, were received from a local resident who said that the existing building was low and modest. The proposed new building was neither of these and would not enhance the conservation area. They also felt that there was no acceptable reason to demolish the existing structure.

Representations, in objection, were received from the Parish Council who said that the development would have a negative impact on the public footpath which was bordered by old hedgerows. The current bungalow was set back whereas the blank gabled end of the proposed building would be much nearer to the road and thus have a greater impact on the area. Trees that were currently on the land did not appear on the plans and it was not clear whether these would be felled or not.

Councillor Aspden spoke, in objection, on behalf of local residents and stated that the proposed development would be within an historical village setting but would not benefit the local community in anyway. There could be no benefit to demolishing a modest bungalow and replacing it with a large and expensive two-storey house. Bungalows were needed by the local community and the development was against guidelines given in PPG15 and HE5.

Members were concerned that there had been no sustainability statement submitted and did not feel that a serviceable bungalow should be demolished to build a two-storey dwelling. They also felt that 'glimpse' views were an important factor within the conservation area and that a large two-storey building would have a major impact on these.

RESOLVED: That the application be refused.

REASON: It is considered that the proposed dwelling would constitute an unsustainable form of development that would detract from the character and appearance of the conservation area by virtue of its excessive size, scale and massing, resulting in an unduly intrusive and dominant form of development with consequent loss of views both from within and outside the conservation area. Thus the proposal would conflict with Policies HE2, HE3, GP1 and H4a of the City of York Draft Local Plan and Central Government advice within Planning Policy Guidance Note 15 " Planning and the Historic Environment", in particular the statutory requirement to consider the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character and appearance of the conservation area.

54e. 4 Pasture Farm Close York YO10 4PZ (07/00593/CAC)

Members considered a Conservation Area Consent Application submitted by Eden Vale Homes for the demolition of the existing bungalow in the conservation area.

Members felt that, in terms of sustainability, the existing bungalow should not be demolished.

RESOLVED: That the application be refused.

REASON: In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the existing bungalow on the site, by virtue of its modest size, scale and massing, makes a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area. In addition, it is considered that the proposed scheme for redevelopment of this site is unacceptable. In the absence of an approved scheme for redevelopment of the site, to grant consent for the demolition of the existing buildings on the site would be contrary to the advice given in paragraph 4.27 of Planning Policy Guidance Note 15: "Planning and the Historic Environment". For the same reason the proposed demolition would also be contrary to Policy HE5 of the City of York Draft Local Plan which states that consent will not be granted for demolition in conservation areas unless a building contract for redevelopment works has been made and planning permission for those works has been granted.

54f. 4 Conway Close York YO30 5WF (07/02068/FUL)

Members considered a full application submitted by Mr & Mrs Neilson for a single storey pitched roof side and rear extension.

RESOLVED: That the application be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

REASON: That the proposal, subject to the conditions listed in the report, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the effect on the streetscene and the impact on the amenity and living conditions of adjacent residents. As such the proposal complies with Policies H7 and GP1 of the City of York Deposit Draft Local Plan.

54g. Derwent County Junior And Infant School Osbaldwick Lane York YO10 3AU (07/01774/GRG3)

Members considered a General Regulations (Reg3) Application submitted by the City of York Council for the erection of a new changing block, floodlit multi use games area, a natural turf football pitch and widening of the footpath.

Officers updated that there was an additional condition and informative regarding the submission of a sustainable design and construction statement. There were also amendments to Conditions 4 and 5 in the report and these were detailed in the resolution below.

Representations were received from the Applicant's agent who said that the development of a multi use games area would be beneficial to the whole of the community. The current football pitch was very boggy and dirty. The school currently suffered from trespassing and the extension of the fence would be beneficial in helping to combat this. He felt that a 1.8m acoustic fence may restrict sightlines and felt that strengthening existing fencing may be a better option. He also felt that an open mesh fence would be better otherwise a 'dark alley' would be created that people would not feel safe using. The new changing rooms would have a condensing boiler as well as high energy, low consumption fittings.

Members raised concerns about the acoustic fence and were happy to delegate to Officers that discussions were undertaken with local residents regarding their views.

RESOLVED: That the application be approved subject to the conditions listed in the report and the following additional and amended conditions:

Amended Condition 3

The opening hours of the multi use games area, associated floodlighting and the football pitch shall be confined to the following hours and the area shall be kept locked at all other times.

Monday to Friday	08.00 to 21.00 hours
Saturday	09.00 to 21.00 hours
Sunday	10.00 to 17.00 hours

The associated floodlighting shall not be operated beyond the hours specified in this condition.

Reason: To protect the amenity of nearby residents.

Amended Condition 4

Details of all means of enclosure to the site boundaries shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before the development commences and shall be provided before the development is occupied.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the area.

Amended Condition 5

The floodlighting shall be installed in accordance with the scheme submitted and approved by the Local Planning Authority and shall be adjusted in order to prevent glare or light spillage into the curtilages of the adjacent residential properties. Once installed it should be fully maintained thereafter.

Reason: To protect the amenity of nearby residents.

Additional Condition

Prior to the commencement of the development, the developer shall submit a sustainable design and construction statement for the written approval of the Local Planning Authority. The statement shall include details of measures to be incorporated into the proposal to ensure a sustainable form of development on the site.

Reason: In the interests of promoting sustainable development and the protection of the environment.

REASON: That the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to impact on residential amenity. As such the proposal complies with Policy GP1 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft.

R MOORE
Chair

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 3.55 pm.